

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION

JASON M. CHARTIER AND BRONSON  
HEALTH CARE GROUP, INC.,

Plaintiffs,

Case No: 1:23-cv-1087  
Hon. Jane M. Beckering

vs.

LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY;  
LIBERTY MUTUAL FIRE INSURANCE COMPANY;  
LIBERTY INSURANCE CORPORATION; THE  
FIRST LIBERTY INSURANCE CORPORATION;  
LIBERTY INSURANCE UNDERWRITERS,  
INC.; SAFECO INSURANCE COMPANY OF  
ILLINOIS; LM GENERAL INSURANCE  
COMPANY; LM INSURANCE CORPORATION;  
LIBERTY MUTUAL PERSONAL INSURANCE  
COMPANY; LIBERTY PERSONAL INSURANCE  
COMPANY; SAFECO INSURANCE COMPANY  
OF AMERICA; AMERICAN ECONOMY  
INSURANCE COMPANY; AND LM PROPERTY  
AND CASUALTY INSURANCE COMPANY,

**STIPULATED  
ORDER OF  
DISMISSAL  
WITH  
PREJUDICE**

Defendants.

\_\_\_\_\_ /

MILLER JOHNSON  
RYAN P. DUFFY (P75178)  
CHRISTOPHER N. RORK (P65322)  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs  
45 Ottawa Avenue, S.W., Suite 1100  
P.O. Box 306  
Grand Rapids, MI 49501-0306  
(616) 831-1700  
[duffyr@millerjohnson.com](mailto:duffyr@millerjohnson.com)

COLLINS EINHORN FARRELL PC  
MATTHEW S. LABEAU (P69730)  
Attorney for Defendants  
4000 Town Center, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Southfield, MI 48075  
(248) 355-4141  
[Matthew.labeau@ceflawyers.com](mailto:Matthew.labeau@ceflawyers.com)  
[Julie.staley@ceflawyers.com](mailto:Julie.staley@ceflawyers.com)

---

**STIPULATED ORDER OF DISMISSAL WITH PREJUDICE**

At a session of said Court held in the  
United States District Court,  
Western District of Michigan, Southern Division

on January 29, 2024

PRESENT: HON. JANE M. BECKERING  
U.S. DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

This matter having come before this Honorable Court upon  
Stipulation of the parties, Notice of Hearing being waived, and the Court  
being otherwise fully advised in the premises:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiffs' claims against  
all Defendants are dismissed with prejudice and without interest,  
costs, or attorney fees to either party.

This is a final Order and closes the case.

*/s/ Jane M. Beckering*

---

U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE

I hereby stipulate to the entry of this  
Order:

*/s/Christopher N. Rork (w/consent)*

---

MILLER JOHNSON  
RYAN P. DUFFY (P75178)  
CHRISTOPHER N. RORK (P65322)  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

*/s/Matthew S. LaBeau*

---

MATTHEW S. LABEAU (P69730)  
Attorney for Defendants